

**INDEPENDENT ASSESSMENT OF THE
TOURISM WORKING GROUP (TWG)**

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or TWG	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by SCE	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
RECOMMENDATIONS TO SCE				
<p>Recommendation to SCE1. That SCE provide more guidance about its subject area priorities and weightings to be used in selecting projects for funding.</p>	<p><u>APEC Secretariat</u>: There is work underway in BMC that aims to allow for better feedback about project selection decisions.</p>	<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	
<p>Recommendation to SCE2. That the funding and evaluation process for individual projects with a low funding requirement should be streamlined to reduce the transaction costs being incurred.</p>	<p><u>APEC Secretariat</u>: This recommendation requires BMC consideration.</p>	<p>To forward the recommendation to BMC for consideration.</p>	<p>July 2014</p>	
<p>Recommendation to SCE3. That if multiyear projects are resumed the option of a program approach should be included to make complementary and related projects more attractive.</p>	<p><u>APEC Secretariat</u>: This recommendation requires BMC consideration.</p>	<p>To forward the recommendation to BMC for consideration.</p>	<p>July 2014</p>	

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or TWG	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by TWG	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
RECOMMENDATIONS TO TWG				
<p>Recommendation to TWG 1. That, in developing the strategic plan for 2016 – 2019 the TWG carefully assess the priorities as outlined by the APEC ECOTECH, Leaders statements and Ministerial directives and establish criteria to prioritise the actions to be undertaken in the work plan.</p>		As per the recommendation.	During 2015	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 2. That TWG assess concept notes more fully at the early stages of the process with particular regard to support from proposing economies and the funding requirements to achieve an effective project.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 3. That in the evaluation of projects for funding greater weight is given to those projects that are supported by funding from economies with an interest and commitment to the project. The goal would be to incentivise greater economy and other party commitment and investment in the projects that come forward to APEC for funding.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or TWG	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by TWG	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
RECOMMENDATIONS TO TWG				
<p>Recommendation to TWG 4. That TWG give highest priority to those projects that have the greatest regional application and value.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 5. That TWG place greater emphasis on knowledge transfer of best practice and research within the APEC community as a component of projects.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 6. That TWG explore more of a program approach to projects so that the results of each project inform the next project to increase the benefit resulting from each project.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 7. That the TWG invite a broader range of participants to its workshops to improve the connection with the private sector and also as a means of transferring knowledge into the host economy. That the host economy consider inviting peak industry organisations and tourism academic institutions to participate at workshops held alongside TWG meetings.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or TWG	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by TWG	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
RECOMMENDATIONS TO TWG				
<p>Recommendation to TWG 8. That the ABAC representatives be invited to participate in relevant TWG meetings and in the development of the TWG strategic plan as a means of strengthening the conduit to the APEC business community.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 9. That the TWG Lead Shepherd in conjunction with the Program Director restructure the TWG meeting agendas so there is a clear distinction between agenda items that are for discussion and decision, and those that are for information only.</p> <p>For those action items, to circulate the papers well in advance, four weeks before the meeting to enable economies to consider their positions, consult internally and address any issues that may arise so that they are better equipped to represent their economies at the meeting.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 10. That the Program Director take a more active approach to seeking input to key agenda items such as the development of</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or TWG	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by TWG	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
RECOMMENDATIONS TO TWG				
the strategic plan and decisions and responses around projects. While there is no restriction at present on written responses being tabled by economies at meetings, the Secretariat should explicitly seek written responses from economies unable to attend.				
<p>Recommendation to TWG 11.</p> <p>That the TWG develop an agreed agenda of intersessional touch points between meetings to transact administrative business such as the finalisation of project proposals and concept notes seeking funding. This agenda should be agreed by members 12 months in advance and form the basis of an ongoing dialogue by working group members. It appears that there is often a rush to meet deadlines and that the meeting schedule is often not able to be aligned with the funding timetable for projects.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 12.</p> <p>That in the years when there is not a Tourism Ministers meeting, the second meeting of TWG in that year be scheduled to align with another working group as a collaborative meeting or with a SOM</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or TWG	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by TWG	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
RECOMMENDATIONS TO TWG				
meeting to enable greater connection across the APEC working groups.				
<p>Recommendation to TWG 13. That, prior to the Ministerial meeting every second year the TWG should commission or internally prepare a “State of APEC Tourism” report for consideration and adoption by Ministers and as a contribution to the Leaders declaration and other agenda setting processes of APEC. To achieve this, the TWG should seek the support of the APEC PSU and second seek assistance from WTTC and PATA as sources of statistical information.</p>	<p>APEC Secretariat: While desirable, this may be a major undertaking and PSU support cannot be assumed (PSU Board support will be required).</p>	<p>TWG to consider and action, if feasible.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 14. That the TWG develop a standardised reporting template for economies to present their tourism information to the meeting and as a contribution to the “State of APEC Tourism” report.</p>		<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 15. That the TWG member economies consider the agenda topics of TWG and select their delegations with relevant expertise and knowledge to make a</p>		<p>As per the recommendation.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or TWG	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by TWG	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
RECOMMENDATIONS TO TWG				
contribution to the dialogue on these topics at the meetings.				
<p>Recommendation to TWG 16. That the TWG comprehensively review the Tourism Charter and in particular the actions under the four goals, by 2016 with a view to ensuring that the TWG mandate and its strategic plan align with APEC ECOTECH priorities.</p>		As per the recommendation.	During 2015	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 17. That APEC SOM take a stronger leadership and coordination position by supporting and enabling joint or back to back meetings of working groups and providing additional support to Lead Shepherds to coordinate with other working groups.</p>	<p><i>APEC Secretariat:</i> Supporting or enabling back to back meetings is desirable but requires coordination with the host economy. Changes made to the SCE-COW arrangements in 2014 aimed to provide greater support for chairs and lead shepherds to coordinate with other groups and the TWG Lead Shepherd is encouraged to attend SCE-COW to take advantage of these arrangements.</p>	As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 18. That economies developing significant projects and multi workstream projects be required to consult with other relevant working groups and report on the connections in the final project proposal that is submitted for funding.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 19.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	

Recommendations by Independent Assessor	Comments from member economies and/or APEC Secretariat	Suggested Action to be taken by SCE or TWG	Proposed timeline to implement the recommendation by TWG	Agreement on the suggested action (Yes/No)
RECOMMENDATIONS TO TWG				
That the TWG extend an invitation to the Tourism Unit of the OECD to be a guest at all subsequent TWG meetings and include OECD in the document distribution from the meetings.				
<p>Recommendation to TWG 20.</p> <p>That the TWG consult formally with OECD, PATA, WTTC and UNWTO on the development of its draft strategic plan so that it is consistent and complementary with the work of these international organisations. In particular widely circulate the proposed implementation schedule so that there is an opportunity to partner with these organisations on key projects.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	
<p>Recommendation to TWG 21.</p> <p>That the TWG explore and support a collaborative approach with other multilateral organisations to projects, where possible that will progress the mission of the TWG.</p>		As per the recommendation.	Ongoing	